

**Butler County Board of Elections
Board Meeting Minutes
December 17, 2012**

The Butler County Board of Elections met on Monday, December 17, 2012, at 2:30 p.m. for a regular meeting. Roll call was taken and present were Chairman Frank Cloud, Member Bruce Carter, Member Tom Ellis, Director Lynn Edward Kinkaid, Deputy Director Jocelyn Bucaro, and Administrative Coordinators Donna DeFazio and Tiffany Harmon. Member Judy Shelton was absent from the meeting. Also present was Charlie Young, Butler County Administrator, Martha and Jim Ruhl and Mary and Dan Hancock, community residents.

Chairman Cloud submitted the bills for review. Member Ellis questioned how Ballot on Demand fees were calculated and Deputy Director Bucaro stated the Board of Elections pays \$0.45 per ballot page. Member Carter moved to accept the bills; seconded by Member Ellis. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member Carter	yea
Member Ellis	yea

All in favor; motion carried.

Minutes from the November 5, November 6, 2012, November 19, 2012, November 20, 2012 and November 26, 2012 meetings were reviewed by the Board. Member Carter moved to accept the minutes; seconded by Member Ellis. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member Carter	yea
Member Ellis	yea

All in favor; motion carried.

Deputy Director Bucaro presented a review of the 2012 Budget Expenses, including comparisons to the budget proposals as well as 2008 expenses. The presentation began with a review of election-related expenses, with a side-by-side comparison of what was projected versus what was spent. Those expenses

include staff overtime, temporary office staff, election workers, polling place rentals, moving expenses, ballot printing and postage.

Election Related Expenses

Budget Proposal:

- FT Staff Overtime = \$275,861 (8,497.75 hrs worked)
- Election Worker Salaries = \$517,172
- *Total Temp Staff (PT, Temp Agency, PW Trainers) = \$289,720*
 - Temp Agency Staff = \$175,000
 - PT Staff Payroll = \$114,720
- Sheriff Deputies = \$8,880
- IT Overtime = \$11,000
- Moving Expenses = \$30,000
- Polling Place Rentals = \$2,000
- Polling Place Custodial Fees = \$2,260
- Ballot Printing Costs = \$127,774
- Postage = \$130,393

Total Expected = \$1,394,980

Actual Expenses:

- FT Staff Overtime = \$206,232 (6,847 hrs worked)
- Election Workers Salaries = \$462,877
- *Total Temp Staff (PT & Temp Agency) = \$275,719*
 - Temp Agency Staff = \$51,890 (YTD)
 - PT Staff Payroll (non Election Worker) = \$212,442
- Sheriff Deputies = \$6,363
- IT Overtime = \$7,111.81
- Moving Expenses = \$24,252
- Polling Place Rentals = \$1,855
- Polling Place Custodial Fees = \$4,890
- Ballot Printing Costs = \$75,789
- Postage = \$96,947

Total Actual = \$1,150,648

2

Overall, the Board expenses totaled \$3.4 Million, compared to the \$3.7 Million in the revised budget proposal approved by the Commissioners, and well under the \$4.4 Million spent in 2008.

Deputy Director Bucaro said the Board will be returning approximately \$200,000 to the County General Fund at the end of 2012, which exceeds the Commissioners' original request of 3% in August 2012. Member Ellis asked Butler County Administrator Charlie Young about paying the 2013 Software License and Extended Warranty fees on election equipment out of 2012 funds. Mr. Young stated that because the Board had the funds to pay the amount in advance, he had advised doing that. He suggested budgeting \$100,000 toward 2014 fees in the 2013 budget to pay at least half next December.

Deputy Director Bucaro proceeded to discuss a request from the Commissioners that the Board reduce the 2013 budget request from \$2.6 Million to \$2.3 Million. She provided several cost-saving steps the Board could take to meet this request, including reducing the number of precincts, adjusting overtime hours to better fit increased efficiencies and by not filling open full-time positions in 2013.

Through these efforts, the Board could save an additional \$265,000 out of next year's budget.

Mr. Young commended Deputy Director Bucaro and Director Kinkaid for doing such a great job in managing the Board of Elections budget.

Director Kinkaid commented to the visitors that he was glad they were present to see the overview of the Board of Elections budget. Also, he commended the Board and the staff for the great job that was done during the 2012 Presidential Election.

Director Kinkaid reviewed the following Secretary of State Directives, Advisories and Memoranda with the Board:

Directives:

<u>Date</u>		<u>Subject</u>
11/20/2012	2012-56	Post-Election Audit <i>In 2009, the previous administration entered into a settlement agreement in the case of League of Women Voters, et al. v. Brunner (formerly Blackwell), N.D. Ohio No. 3:05-cv-7309. As explained in <u>Advisory 2009-09</u>, the League of Women Voters settlement agreement requires that county boards of elections conduct post-election audits of all ballots cast following general elections in even-numbered years and following presidential primary elections. The additional statewide office to be included in the audit is the contest for Ohio Supreme Court between Terrence O'Donnell and Michael Skindell.</i>
12/05/2012	2012-57	2012 Annual Report of Expenses of the Board <i>Each Board of Elections must make an annual report to the Secretary of State indicating the expenditures made in administering elections and supplemental information. The reports from each of the county boards of elections, due by January 18, 2013, are used to prepare the Secretary of State's annual report to the Governor, mandated by R.C. 3501.05 (O).</i>
12/05/2012	2012-58	Elections Assistance Commission (EAC) Survey: 2011-2012 <i>The U.S. EAC is charged with collecting specific data regarding federal elections from each state as mandated by the Help America Vote Act of 2002 (HAVA). As part of the HAVA requirements, the Secretary of State's Office must collect data from each county board of elections, compile the</i>

information received, and submit responses for the 2012 Election Administration and Voting Survey report to the EAC by February 1, 2013.

There were no advisories from the Secretary of State.

Memoranda from the Secretary of State:

<u>Date</u>	<u>Subject</u>
12/04/2012	HHS Grant Funds for In-Person Poll worker Training (Veronica Sherman)
12/04/2012	HHS Grant Funds for Online Poll worker Training (Veronica Sherman)
12/07/2012	2013 Elections Calendar (Matt Masterson)
12/10/2012	2013 Judicial Candidate Seminar Schedule (Curt Mayhew)

Under Old Business, Deputy Director Bucaro shared that the Board received a memo from Middletown City Councilman A.J. Smith's treasurer addressing the missing items from his previous campaign finance reports from his 2009 campaign. There are still a few outstanding issues. Member Carter moved that the Board withdraw their complaint with the Ohio Election Commission finding he has shown due diligence in trying to resolve matter, but noted that Mr. Smith must address the remaining questions before December 31, 2012 or the Board will refile a complaint. The motion was seconded by Member Ellis. Roll call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member Carter	yea
Member Ellis	yea

All in favor; motion carried.

Under New Business, Director Kinkaid handed out the revised OAEO Conference schedule for January 8-11, 2013.

Mr. Hancock, a visitor in the meeting, asked when the next election was being held and what would be needed to put a levy on the ballot. Deputy Director Bucaro suggested that they seek the advice of an attorney. She stated Board

staff can research the petition signatures needed and the filing deadline and will call to follow up with them on those questions.

Member Ellis moved that Election Night Reporting be paid from the 2012 budget; no second was made so the motion died for a lack of a second.

Under the Deputy Director's report, Deputy Director Bucaro reminded Board members that the staff were collecting funds to help sponsor a needy family for Christmas.

She also stated that the post-election audit was complete, everything balanced, and the audit results had been submitted to the Secretary of State.

Member Carter moved to adjourn the meeting; seconded by Member Ellis. Roll call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member Carter	yea
Member Ellis	yea

All in favor; motion carried.

The meeting was adjourned at approximately 4:20 p.m.

Frank Cloud, Chairman

Lynn Edward Kinkaid, Director

Thomas W. Ellis, Member

Absent
Judith A. Shelton, Member

Bruce Carter, Member